



UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

**PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW
2006**

CASES AND MATERIALS

Professor Janet Walker



PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW 2006

CASES AND MATERIALS

Professor Janet Walker*

Introduction

Beals v Saldanha	1
Constitution Act/Courts of Justice Act	3

PART I - JUDGMENTS

1. The Conclusiveness of Foreign Judgments

Godard v Gray	6
Lax v Lax	9

2. The Requirements for Recognition and Enforcement

(a) Prima Facie Enforceability

(i) Jurisdiction in the International Sense

Schibsby v Westenholz	14
Constitution of the United States of America, Article IV, Amendments V, XIV	18
International Shoe Co v State of Washington	18
Morguard Investments Ltd. v De Savoye	22
Braintech, Inc v Kostiuk	36

(ii) Finality

Four Embarcadero Center Venture v Mr. Greenjeans Corp.	41
Uniforêt Pate Port-Cartier v Zerotech Technologies Inc.	44
Pro Swing Inc v ELTA Golf Inc.....	49
Beatty v Beatty	51
Interjurisdictional Support Orders Act.....	52

(b) Foreign public law exception

United States of America v Ivey	57
Cuban Liberty and Democratic Solidarity (Libertad) Act of 1996	68
Foreign Extraterritorial Measures Act	69

(c) Impeachment

(i) Fraud

Beals v Saldanha (majority)	74
-----------------------------------	----

(ii) Natural Justice

Beals v Saldanha (dissent)	86
Orabi v Qaoud	93
State Bank of India v Navaratna.....	97

(iii) Public Policy

Boardwalk Regency Corp. v Maalouf.....	106
Kidron v Grean.....	112

* These materials are provided solely for the use of the students in LAW228H1S in the First Term of 2006.

(iv) Prior Inconsistent Local Judgment	
Vervaeke (Formerly Messina) v Smith	116

3. Codifications in Federal and Regional Systems

Québec Civil Code: Book Ten - Title Four.....	121
Brussels Regulation - Preamble, Articles 1, 32-56	123
Uniform Enforcement of Canadian Judgments Act	129
ALI- Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Judgments Act	131
Hague Choice of Court Convention	136

PART II – JURISDICTION

1. The Bases of Jurisdiction

a) Consent

(i) Attornment	
Roglass Consultants v Kennedy	139
Dovenmuehle v Rocca Group	139
Currie v McDonald's Restaurants of Canada Ltd	142
Brussels Regulation - Articles 24-26	152
(ii) Agreement	
McKender v Feldia.....	153
“The Canmar Fortune”	158
Rudder v Microsoft Corp	165
Underwriters at Lloyds’ v Mauran	169
Brussels Regulation - Article 23	170
GreCon Dimter Inc v JR Normand Inc.....	171

(b) Defendant’s Home Court

(i) Individuals	
Maharanee of Baroda v Wildenstein.....	178
Burhnam v Superior Court	181
(ii) Corporations	
Extra-provincial Corporations Act	187
Adams v Cape Industries plc.....	187
ILA Committee on International Civil and Commercial Litigation Resolution	189
(iii) Assets	
SDI Simulation Group Inc. v Chameleon Technologies Inc.....	189
Tortel Communication Inc. v Suntel, Inc	192
(iii) Domicile/Residence	
Ontario Rules of Civil Procedure, Rule 16.03	194

(c) Real and Substantial Connection

Rule 17 — Service Outside Ontario.....	195
Moran v Pyle National (Canada) Ltd.	197
Uniform Court Jurisdiction and Proceedings Transfer Act: Part 2	200

Brussels Regulation - Articles 5-21	203
Québec Civil Code: Book Ten – Title Three	207
Spar Aerospace.....	209

(d) Order and Fairness

Muscott v Courcelles.....	223
---------------------------	-----

2. Determining Appropriate Forum

(a) The Doctrine of Forum Non Conveniens

Airbus Industrie GIE v Patel	241
Amchem Products Inc. v British Columbia (Workers' Compensation Board).....	242
Spiliada Maritime Corp. v Cansulex Ltd.	259
Societe Nationale Industrielle Aerospatiale v Lee Kui Juk	266
Owusu v Jackson.....	272

(b) The Burden of Proof

Frymer v Brettschneider.....	278
------------------------------	-----

(c) Personal/Juridical Advantage

Jaffe v Dearing	282
Connelley v RTZ Corporation plc.....	285
Lubbe v Cape plc.....	290
Oakley v Barry	295

(d) Jurisdiction Agreements

The “Angelic Grace”.....	300
Erich Gasser GmbH v Misat Srl.....	307

(e) The Injunction Test Revisited

Airbus Industrie GIE v Patel	315
Hudon v Geos Language Corporation.....	325
Turner v Grovit.....	328

(f) Single Forum Cases/Negative Declarations

Midland Bank plc v Laker Airways Ltd.....	331
---	-----

(g) Multiplicity

Brussels Convention - Articles 21-23	335
472900 BC Ltd v Thrifty Canada.	335
Westec Aerospace Inc v Raytheon Aircraft Co.	342
Leuven/London Principles	349

(h) Transfers of Proceedings

28 United States Code Service §§1404, 1406.....	352
---	-----

Jurisdiction of Courts (Cross-vesting) Act, 1987 (Australia)	353
Bankinvest AG v Seabrook	354
Uniform Court Jurisdiction and Proceedings Transfer Act: Part 3.....	356
(i) Interim Relief	
Brussels Convention - Article 24	358
Aetna Financial Services Limited v Feigelman	358
Republic of Haiti v Duvalier	361
United States of America v Friedland.....	367
United States of America v Yemec	368
3. Limitations on Jurisdiction	
(a) State Immunity	
The State Immunity Act	374
Schreiber v Federal Republic of Germany.....	377
Bouzari v Iran.....	384
(b) Matters Subject to Treaty	
Carriage by Air Act	393
Gal v Northern Mountain Helicopters Inc	393
Marine Liability Act, s 46	397
Magic Sportswear Corp v The Mathilde Maersk.....	398
International Commercial Arbitration Act	402
Kaverit Steel and Crane v Kone Corp.....	409
Masterfile Corp v Graphic Images Ltd	415
(c) Exclusive Jurisdiction	
Duke v Andler	417
Brussels Regulation - Articles 22, 25.....	421
Voyage Co Industries v Craster	422
West v Wilbur	424
Nord Resources Corp v Nord Pacific Ltd	426
Compensation (Prohibition of Foreign Legal Proceedings) Act 1995 (PPNG)	428
Quebec Civil Code, Arts 3129, 3151	429
PART III – CHOICE OF LAW-GENERAL PRINCIPLES	
1. Choice of Law Methodology	
Macmillan Inc v Bishopsgate Investment Trust plc (No 3)	431
Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One	432
Babcock v Jackson	433
Bernhard v Harrah's Club	436
Breavington v Gidleman.....	442
Stevens v Head	445
Hunt v T&N plc.....	446
2. Proof of Foreign Law	
Old North State Brewing Co v Newlands Services Inc.....	453

Royal Trust Corp of Canada v AS(W)S	460
Petkus v Becker	464
Etler v Kertesz	465
Mercantile Mutual Insurance (Australia) Ltd v Neilson	466
3. Characterization and the Incidental Question	
Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One, Article 3078	469
Kingsway General Insurance Co v Canada Life Assurance Co	470
Agnew v Gober	472
Schwebel v Ungar	474
4. Domicile	
Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title Two, Chapter I – Personal Status	475
Winans v Attorney General	477
Re Annesley	480
Osthvath-Latcoczy v Osthvath-Latcoczy	483
Patterson v Patterson	484
White v Tenant	486
5. Renvoi and the Time Element	
Re Annesley	491
Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One, Article 3080	493
Ross v Ross	493
Neilson v Overseas Projects Corporation of Victoria Ltd	495
Starkowski v AG	503
Roy v North American Leisure Group Inc	505
6. Substance and Procedure	
(a) The Basic Rule	
Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title One, Articles 3132, 3133	508
Tolofson v Jensen	509
Castillo v Castillo	512
(b) Examples	
(i) Evidence	
In re Cohn	514
(ii) Remedies	
Somers v Fournier	515
7. Foreign Public Law	
Laane v Estonian Cargo and Passenger Steamship Line	526
AG (UK) v Heinemann Publishers Australia Pty Ltd	529
Kuwait Airways Corporation v Iraqi Airways	535

8. Public Policy

Vladi v Vladi	548
---------------------	-----

PART IV – CHOICE OF LAW: AREAS OF LAW

1. Tort

Quebec Civil Code: Book Ten, Title Two, Articles 3126-3128	553
Tolofson v Jensen; Lucas v Gagnon	554
Johnson v Coventry Churchill International Ltd.....	570
Hanlan v Sernesky.....	575
Wong v Wei	576
Wong v Lee	582
PIL (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1995 Part III - Choice of Law in Tort and Delict .	592
Shevill v Presse Alliance SA.....	594

2. Contract

(a) Determining the Proper Law

Star Texas	598
Imperial Life Assurance Co. of Canada v Colmenares	602
Amin Rasheed Shipping Corporation v Kuwait Insurance Co	604
Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3111-3113	607
The Rome Convention- Articles 1-4, 10, 12-15, 17-19	608

(b) Applying the Proper Law

(i) Capacity

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3083-3087	611
The Rome Convention- Article 11	611
Bondholders Securities Corp v Manville	612

(ii) Validity

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3109-3110	614
The Rome Convention- Article 8	614
Etler v Kertesz	615

(iii) Special Kinds of Contracts

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3114-3120	621
The Rome Convention- Articles 5-7, 16	622

(iii) Harmonization of the Law of International Sales Contracts

International Sale of Goods Act	624
---------------------------------------	-----

3. Property

Quebec Civil Code, Article 3097	625
---------------------------------------	-----

(a) Immovables

Godley v Coles	626
Landry v Lachapelle.....	628

(b) Movables

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3102-3106	630
Macmillan Inc v Bishopsgate Investment Trust plc (No 3)	631
Personal Property Security Act (ss. 5-8)	640
Re TCT Logistics Inc	641

4. Succession

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3098-3101, 3107-3108	646
--	-----

(a) Administration

Estates Administration Act	647
Estates Act	647
Ontario Rules of Civil Procedure	649

(b) Succession

Succession Law Reform Act	649
Re Vak Estate	650
Allison v Allison	653

5. Family Law**(a) Formal Validity of Marriages**

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3088-3089	655
Berthiaume v Dastous	655
McCabe v McCabe	658

(b) Essential Validity of Marriages

Frew (otherwise Reed) v Reed	660
Marriage Act	662
Marriage (Prohibited Degrees) Act	664
Feiner v Demkowicz (falsely called Feiner)	664
Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) v Narwal	667

(c) Divorce and Ancillary Relief

Quebec Civil Code, Articles 3090-3096, 3122-3124	670
Divorce Act, ss 3-6, 22-23	671
Family Law Act, ss 1, 15, 58	672

PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW – FIRST TERM 2006

Professor Janet Walker (416) 736-5580 jwalker@yorku.ca

<http://research.osgoode.yorku.ca/walker>

September

Thursdays 10:10-12:00 2:10-4:00

7	Introduction	I – JUDGMENTS - 1. Conclusiveness 2. Requirements (a) Enforceability (i) Jurisdiction
14	(ii) Finality (b) Foreign Public Law Exception	(c) Impeachment 3. Codifications
21	II – JURISDICTION 1. Bases of Jurisdiction (a) Consent	(b) Defendant's Home Court
28	(c) Real & Substantial Connection	(d) Order and Fairness

October

12	2. Determining Appropriate Forum (a) Forum Non Conveniens (b) Burden of Proof	(c) Personal/Juridical Advantage (d) Jurisdiction Agreements (e) Injunction Test Revisited
19	(f) Single Forum Cases/Negative Declarations (g) Multiplicity (h) Transfers of Proceedings (i) Interim Relief	3. Limitations on Jurisdiction (a) State Immunity (b) Treaties
20	(<i>Make-up Class from OCIs</i>) (c) Exclusive Jurisdiction III-CHOICE OF LAW: GENERAL PRINCIPLES 1. Choice of Law Methodology 2. Proof of Foreign Law	
26	3. Characterization/Incidental Question	4. Domicile

November

2	5. Renvoi and the Time Element	6. Substance and Procedure (a) General Principles
16	6. (b) Examples: Evidence, Remedies	7. Foreign Public Law 8. Public Policy
23	IV-CHOICE OF LAW: AREAS OF LAW 1. Tort	2. Contract
30	3. Property 4. Succession	5. Family Law

Examination: December 12 (Advance Essay Questions Available December 5)